

Westminster City Council
Hallfield Estate Phase 3
Refurbishment Works
Programme

Executive Summary

Independent Validation and
Assessment of Scope & Cost



City of Westminster

WCC Hallfield Estate Phase 3 Refurbishment Works Programme

Independent Validation and Assessment of Scope & Costs

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

John Rowan and Partners (JRP) were appointed by Westminster City Council (WCC) to undertake an independent validation and assessment of scope and cost regarding the proposed refurbishment works programme on the WCC Hallfield Estate London W2.

The basis of this assurance approach is an assessment of scope with cost focussed on the priced work schedule, notably the Cost Plan v2 dated June 2023 which was submitted by Axis Europe to WCC.

The purpose of the independent validation and assessment of scope and costs for the Hallfield Estate Phase 3 programme of works is to provide WCC with an assurance of both the proposed scope of works and associated costs that Axis Europe submitted with specific regard to the potential Section 20 leaseholder liabilities and services charges that may be applied.

JRP approached the independent audit based on a desktop assessment and detailed analysis of the Axis Europe Cost Plan and an on-site assessment and comparison of the cost plan with the actual scope of works proposals and site conditions.

To establish and confirm the scope of the programme, JRP undertook a review of condition reports undertaken by construction and property consultants which clearly set out the condition of the key elements and components at the Phase 3 blocks notably Winchester, Worcester and Lynton House.

Through our investigation there are two main conclusions around cost and scope. Firstly, that the programme can evidence Value for Money and Best Value in the cost plan. The programme costs as compared to what we would expect to see as quantity assured market costs are within 3.89%, an acceptable margin on a programme of this size.

Secondly, that roof replacement should be included within the scope of the programme given the condition and deterioration of the roof structure.

Scope of Programme

The overarching statement within the fabric condition report states that “Generally the blocks are in poor condition with various elements reaching the end of their working life. Additionally, there are significant issues with corroded reinforcement and spalling concrete to the frames and corrosion to the cladding panels” with the report providing recommendations on the replacement and repairs of the major elements and components as detailed within the report.

JRP undertook an on site inspection to assess and validate the key findings on the condition of the key block elements and components as set out in the consultants condition survey report and in the main, JRP would concur with the report findings and recommendations and confirm that the scope of works proposed is both justified and necessary to maintain the life cycle of the

key building elements and reduce reactive and planned maintenance costs in the short and long term.

As part of the commission, WCC requested that JRP inspect the existing main roofs to the three blocks and provide our assessment of the current condition of the main roof areas and we reported that the condition of the roof areas is in a poor condition, beyond economic repair and service life with typical flat roof defects present.

In addition, a specialist flat roofing company, Bauder Roofing undertook roof surveys including intrusive surveys to the roof areas in February 2024 and has provided roof reports which confirmed that the condition of the roof areas was consistent with the JRP findings.

Costs

Our approach to the validation and assessment of the Axis Europe Cost Plan was based on the desktop and on site value engineering of costs comparing the Axis Europe prices with JRP cost information including market prices and rates on similar type projects, in the main comparison of cost was done on a like for like basis.

The purpose of the validation and assessment of the Axis Europe Cost Plan is to offer WCC and its residents assurance to clearly evidence that the prices as submitted by Axis Europe to undertake the scope of works as included for under the Phase 3 programme, provide Value for Money and Best Value to WCC.

JRP raised observations and comments on specific items as contained within the Axis Europe Cost Plan and we have undertaken further assessment of these costs and provided WCC with additional narrative around these specific items.

Following further value engineering assessment, a number of these items are deemed fair and reasonable, but we would recommend that the following items are discussed further with Axis

- Consider including provisional sums following survey to determine if any works required i.e. drainage works following CCTV survey
- Axis have included Builders Work in Connection (BWIC) as a Provisional Sum
- Any Provisional Sums and Quantities to be firmed up as early as possible
- Additional information required from Axis in regard metal doorsets to communal / external areas – door schedule including sizes and dimensions
- Additional information required from Axis in regard to insulation works to soffits including breakdown of costs
- Additional information required from Axis in regard to external wall tiling including breakdown of costs and associated quantities
- Additional information required from Axis in regard to Builders Work in Connection(BWIC) for the window installation including breakdown of costs

- Additional information required from Axis Europe in regard to decorating railings, balustrading and gratings including breakdown of costs.

Through the process of validation and assessment, we can evidence that Value for Money and Best Value, in the main and notwithstanding the items raised above, is being provided by Axis Europe in delivering the WCC Hallfield Estate Phase 3 Programme of Works.